

URI SUSTAINABLE



SEAFOOD INITIATIVE

A Consensus Seafood Guide

Developed by

Michelle Armsby and Cathy A. Roheim

Graduate Research Assistant and Professor
Department of Environmental and Natural Resource Economics
University of Rhode Island
email: crw@uri.edu

for the Sustainable Seafood Forum
September 2008 (amended February 2009)



Disclaimer

Any project this complex contains some degree to subjective decision making on the part of the authors, and the possibility of errors. All efforts were made to avoid any errors and to be as accurate and complete as possible. We wish to thank the various organizations whose guides are referenced in this document for their input in identifying previous errors, and for improving the accurate portrayal of their intent in their guides. We apologize for any remaining errors, or misinterpretations of the guides. These are of course solely the responsibility of the authors.

As with any document of this type, it also will quickly become out of date, as the guides are regularly updated and fisheries sign on to assessment or become certified under the Marine Stewardship program. We hope to continue to update the document as our stakeholders' interest warrants and funding for the project is available.

A Consensus Seafood Guide

At the June 2008 meeting of the Sustainable Seafood Forum (SSF), the members of SSF requested that a consensus seafood guide be developed, based upon the numerous seafood guides (wallet cards) in existence at that time. The purpose of the guide would be to assist seafood buyers with their seafood purchasing decisions from a consensus 'green and yellow' list, as well as to investigate the extent to which the various guides reach consensus. With funding from Sam King of King's Seafood, Michelle Armsby and Dr. Cathy A. Roheim of the University of Rhode Island's Sustainable Seafood Initiative compiled the list contained within this document.

Methodology

Using the Incofish "International Seafood Guide" (www.incofish.org/isfg.php) as an initial starting point, we gathered together a list of the various seafood guides. From that list, we eliminated lists which focused primarily on health issues (PCBs and mercury levels in fish or some combination of health and sustainability), as well as lists that admitted that they were simply following the recommendations of the Monterey Bay Aquarium. In addition, we focused primarily on lists from North America, with the exception of one list which was included from the U.K., as it included many international fisheries pertinent to consumers and buyers in the U.S.

The resulting list of seafood guides are presented on the following page, and include: the Audubon Society, Blue Ocean Institute, Environmental Defense, Marine Conservation Society (U.K.), Monterey Bay Aquarium, and Sea Choice Canada. These lists operate on a traffic light system, where seafood on the 'green' list are 'best choices', those on the 'yellow' list are 'good alternatives' and those on the 'red' list are those to 'avoid.'

While Environmental Defense and Monterey Bay do work together on their rankings, there were instances in their guides where there were either differences in rankings, or where one guide ranked some species the other did not; thus each was included.

The Blue Ocean Institute has shades of green turning to yellow, and shades of orange (yellow turning to red). In order to keep things simple, whatever was classified as chartreuse was categorized as green; and if it was classified as orange, we put it in the red list.

The Audubon list bears special mention, for two reasons. First, it too has green blending into yellow and then yellow blending into red, and as such, some subjectivity in interpretation was required to determine whether the item was 'green', 'yellow' or 'red.' Second, while the Audubon list was available on the web during the time that this study was conducted, it was created in 2004 (thus perhaps outdated). Second, the Audubon organization pulled the guide off the website shortly after this study was completed with the recommendation for readers that they follow the Monterey Bay recommendations. However, we choose to keep the Audubon guide even in this amended version as it serves to highlight the importance of keeping websites up-to-date to minimize consumer confusion.

We also included the Greenpeace 'red' list, which while it is not published as a wallet card, is one that the organization encourages seafood buyers and consumers to mind in their purchasing decisions. We did not include NOAA's Fish Watch, as it does not provide recommendations on species and focuses only on domestic fisheries.

The Seafood Choices Alliance (SCA) effectively only has an 'approved' list; a list of sustainable seafood choices. In going through the list, it appears that SCA essentially recommends species which the NGOs have recommended as either 'green' or 'yellow' list items. Therefore, to code a species with a color was not deemed to be strictly appropriate, and so the SCA recommendation is not considered in the 'consensus' evaluation, but is listed with the species.

Marine Stewardship Council certification or assessment was handled similarly to SCA approval. In other words, it does not count in the evaluation of consensus, but is noted in the far right hand column of the spreadsheets. In many cases, it is not possible to exactly match certified fisheries or those in assessment to species being ranked by the seafood guides as fisheries evaluated by the MSC are often more specific than those in the guides.

Evaluation

The species (items) listed are taken verbatim from the guides themselves. We did not create any new items (at least not intentionally). Where we felt there was clear consensus across groups of rankings of seafood, these species were put into spreadsheets marked as consensus green, yellow or red. There are also cases where there is distinct non-consensus among the groups. The most outstanding example is the disagreement over U.S. Alaskan pollock.

There are arguably cases where there is more consensus than is apparent in the lists, however, each group often fine tunes fisheries in ways that do not make that consensus as apparent from the wallet cards as it perhaps might be. These items were put into a separate list, entitled 'Too Tough to Call: Differentiation by Area, Gear Type or Other.' For example, Audubon gives the overall category of King Crab a yellow ranking, while Blue Ocean Institute gives King Crab a green ranking. However, within the sub-categories of imported king crab, Russian king crab, U.S. king crab, and Alaskan King Crab, the rankings by the other organizations may be red or yellow. The discerning professional seafood buyer will understand the nuances, however, the ordinary seafood consumer may not.

The groups involved in this evaluation have made it clear to the authors that there is significant consensus among them internally regarding the various species in their guides. The results of this study point to a variety of take home messages for both the seafood industry and the environmental community.

First, the wallet cards are not meant to be purchasing guides for professional seafood buyers, even if some use it as such. The environmental community meant wallet cards to be a simple, easy-to-use educational tool for consumers, and have employed extensive marketing research to improve upon them as such. Instead of using these cards, if interested, seafood buyers should be working with the environmental community to use available alternative, more information-rich sustainable seafood purchasing programs.

Second, with the increased propensity on the part of the environmental community to focus on catch site, production method, gear type, and sub-species in the various wallet cards, it does create an appearance of non-consensus amongst the organizations making seafood recommendations, and thus the cards. This can certainly be detrimental to the organizations, as well as the consumer as she/he can become confused assessing across cards. In addition, with that level of detail, it becomes increasingly difficult to locate that type of product in their favorite retailer, resulting in frustrated consumers.

Third, the importance of a cohesive message becomes important if, in fact, seafood buyers are using the wallet guides or on-line guides in lieu of the more information-rich programs offered to them. The perception of conflicting messages between the members of the environmental community does not serve anyone's best interest, certainly not the forward movement of the overall promotion of sustainable seafood.

In conclusion, we are surprised that we are apparently the first to have undertaken a task such as this, although given the difficulties and complexity of the task it is not perhaps surprising. We hope that we have provided a useful document that accurately portrays the complexity of efforts of the various organizations providing seafood recommendations. As we all know, much is made of the level of confusion in the marketplace over what is considered sustainable and what is not. Perhaps this document will be among the first to highlight whether or not such confusion is warranted.

We hope you find it useful.

Description of the Seafood Guides Used as the Basis for this Study*

<u>Organization Authoring the Guide</u>	<u>Description of the Guide and Website of Guide</u>
Audubon Society	The <i>Audubon Seafood Wallet Card</i> is produced by the Audubon Society's Living Oceans Program. The information used for this comparison was acquired from the 2004 edition of the wallet card, which at the time of original publication was found at: http://seafood.audubon.org/ . This organization has since dropped this wallet card and has recommended its members follow the Monterey Bay recommendations. Please see the "Methodology" section for reasons why this card was included in this report.
Blue Ocean Institute	The Blue Ocean Institute has published the <i>Guide to Ocean Friendly Seafood</i> in a wallet size mini-guide. Information within the <i>Guide to Ocean Friendly Seafood</i> was updated in September, 2007. It can be found at: http://www.blueocean.org/seafood/ .
Environmental Defense Fund	The Environmental Defense Fund has created <i>Pocket Seafood Selector</i> to aid consumers in choosing seafood. Though this guide was produced in collaboration with the Monterey Bay Aquarium, some recommendations are slightly different than the Monterey Bay Guide. The version of this guide used in this comparison was copyrighted March 2008. It can be found online at: www.edf.org/seafood .
Greenpeace	Greenpeace, USA does not produce a pocket guide or wallet card, however they have published a red list of fish to avoid. This red list was published in the Greenpeace report "Carting Away the Oceans: How Grocery Stores Are Emptying the Seas" released in June 2008 and can also be found on their website: http://www.greenpeace.org/usa/campaigns/oceans/seafood/red-fish .
Marine Conservation Society	The Marine Conservation Society (MCS) is a non-profit organization based in the United Kingdom. The MCS <i>Good Fish Guide</i> provides UK consumers with a guide to sustainable seafood, with some items applicable to the U.S. market. The pocket guide is an abbreviated version of <i>FishOnline</i> , a more comprehensive online guide to eco-friendly seafood. The version used for this study was The MCS <i>Good Fish Guide</i> , created in 2006, can be found online at: http://www.fishonline.org/advice/avoid/ .
Monterey Bay Aquarium	The Monterey Bay Aquarium through their Seafood Watch Program produces a national and multiple regional guides. Information on mercury contamination of the seafood listed was provided as a result of collaboration with the Environmental Defense Fund, which was disclosed on each of the guides. This comparison utilizes all Seafood Watch Guides (regional and national), the version updated in April 2008, available online at: http://www.mbayaq.org/cr/cr_seafoodwatch/download.asp .
Sea Choice-Canada	SeaChoice is an initiative of Sustainable Seafood Canada, a Canadian conservation organization providing information to consumers about sustainable seafood in the Canadian market. SeaChoice has produced a pocket guide entitled <i>Canada's Seafood Guide</i> . The version used in this comparison was last updated in April 2008 and can be found online at : www.seachoice.org .
Seafood Choices Alliance	Seafood Choices Alliance is an international association aimed at identifying sustainable seafood. Information is only provided on environmentally friendly seafood, rather than listing fish to avoid eating. Seafood Choices Alliance did partner with Blue Ocean Institute, the Environmental Defense Fund, and Monterey Bay Aquarium's Seafood Watch Program in constructing their list. Their list can be found within their sustainable seafood posters, their report <i>Sourcing Seafood: A Professional's Guide to Procuring Ocean-friendly Fish and Shellfish</i> (second edition, 2007), and also online at: http://www.seafoodchoices.com/smartchoices/findseafood.php
Marine Stewardship Council (MSC)	The Marine Stewardship Council (MSC) is an international certification and ecolabeling program for sustainable seafood. Currently certified fisheries and fisheries in assessment to become certified are listed online at: http://www.msc.org .

* pdf copies of the exact guides used may be obtained from the authors if otherwise not obtainable

**Consensus Green List
Seafood Guides**

<u>Item</u>	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council
Abalone (Farmed)			YES		YES			APPROVED	
Arctic Char	YES								
Arctic Char (Farmed)			YES						
Arctic Char (Farmed, Canada, Iceland and U.S.)		YES			YES			APPROVED	
Catfish	YES								
Catfish (U.S.)			YES						
Catfish (farmed)		YES							
Catfish (U.S. farmed)					YES	YES		APPROVED	
Caviar (Farmed)			YES						
Caviar (US Farmed, Sturgeon)					YES			APPROVED	
Caviar (Farmed, White Sturgeon)	YES								
Clams				YES					
Clams (farmed)	YES	YES	YES		YES	YES			
Clams: Pastanek (Farmed)								APPROVED	
Clams: Littleneck (Farmed)	YES							APPROVED	
Clams: Littleneck (Farmed, Alaska)									
Clams: Countneck (Farmed)								APPROVED	
Clams: Geoducks (Farmed)								APPROVED	
Clams: Topneck (Farmed)								APPROVED	
Clams: Manila (Farmed)								APPROVED	
Cockle				YES					
Cockle (farmed)								APPROVED	
Cockle (from Burry Inlet, Wales)				YES				APPROVED	Burry Inlet Cockles- MSC CERTIFIED; Lakes and Coorong Fishery, South Australia- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Cod: Pacific		YES							
Cod: Pacific (bottom longline)			YES						
Cod: Pacific (line caught)				YES					
Cod: Pacific (bottom longline, jig, pot)						YES			
Cod: Pacific (Alaskan Longline)					YES			APPROVED	Bering Sea and Aleutian Island Alaska (Pacific) Cod- Freezer, Longline- MSC CERTIFIED
Crab									
Crab: Dungeness		YES	YES		YES	YES		APPROVED	Oregon Dungeness Crab- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; California Dungeness Crab- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Crab: Stone	YES	YES	YES		YES			APPROVED	
Crawfish (U.S.)			YES						
Crawfish (U.S. farmed)					YES				
Croaker									
Croaker: Atlantic					YES			APPROVED	

**Consensus Green List
Seafood Guides**

<u>Item</u>	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council
Herring									Thames Blackwater Herring Drift Net Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED; Hastings Fleet Pelagic Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED; Pelagic Freezer-Trawler Association North Sea Herring- MSC CERTIFIED; Scottish Pelagic Sustainability Group Ltd North Sea Herring- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Astrid Fiske North Sea Herring Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Norwegian Spring Spawning Herring- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Norwegian North Sea and Skagerrak Herring Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; North Sea and Skagerrak/Kattegat Herring Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Herring: Atlantic					YES			APPROVED	
Herring: Atlantic (U.S.)						YES			
Herring: Pacific (Canada)						YES			
Herring: Atlantic (Thames, North Sea)				YES					
Lobster									
Lobster: Spiny (U.S.)					YES				
Lobster: Spiny (U.S., Australia & Baja)		YES						APPROVED	
Lobster: Western Rock (Australia)				YES				APPROVED	
Lobster: Rock/Spiny (U.S., Western Baja & Australia)						YES		APPROVED	Western Australia Rock Lobster- MSC CERTIFIED; Mexican Baja Red Rock Lobster- MSC CERTIFIED
Lobster: Rock/Spiny (U.S., Western Australia, Mexico, wild trap caught)								APPROVED	
Mackerel		YES						APPROVED	South West Handline Mackerel Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED; Hastings Fleet Pelagic Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED
Mackerel: Spanish					YES				North East Atlantic Mackerel Pelagic Trawl, Purse-Seine and Handline- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Pelagic Freezer-Trawler Assoc. North East Atlantic Mackerel Pelagic Trawl Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Scottish Pelagic Sustainability Group Ltd North East Atlantic Mackerel- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Mackerel: Spanish (Atlantic)								APPROVED	
Mackerel: Spanish (U.S. Atlantic and Gulf of Mexico)	YES								
Mackerel: Atlantic			YES						
Mussels									Danish Blue Shell Mussel Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Mussels (farmed)	YES	YES	YES		YES	YES	YES	APPROVED	
Mussels: Prince Edward Island (farmed)								APPROVED	
Mussels: Greenlip (farmed, New Zealand)								APPROVED	
Mussels: Mediterranean (farmed)								APPROVED	
Mussels: Blue (farmed)								APPROVED	
Oyster									
Oysters (farmed)	YES	YES	YES		YES	YES			
Oysters: Eastern (farmed)								APPROVED	

Consensus Green List									
Seafood Guides									
Item	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council
Oysters: Pacific (farmed)				YES				APPROVED	
Prawns									
Prawns: Sidestripe, spot (trap-caught, British Columbia)						YES			
Prawns: Spot (Alaska, British Columbia)								APPROVED	
Sablefish/Black Cod	YES								
Sablefish/Black Cod (Alaska, Canada)		YES							
Sablefish/Black Cod (Alaska, British Columbia)					YES	YES		APPROVED	U.S. North Pacific Sablefish- MSC CERTIFIED
Salmon: Alaskan	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES			APPROVED	Alaska Salmon Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED
Sardines			YES		YES				
Sardines (U.S.)						YES			
Sardine: Pacific								APPROVED	Gulf of California, Mexico Sardine Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Scallops									Patagonian Scallop- MSC CERTIFIED
Scallops: Bay									
Scallops: Bay (farmed)	YES		YES		YES			APPROVED	
Shrimp: Pink (Oregon)			YES		YES			APPROVED	Oregon Pink Shrimp- MSC CERTIFIED
Striped Bass	YES	YES						APPROVED	
Striped Bass (wild)					YES			APPROVED	Maryland Striped Bass- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Striped Bass (farmed)					YES			APPROVED	
Striped Bass: Hybrid			YES						
Sturgeon (Farmed)			YES		YES	YES		APPROVED	
Tilapia (US)			YES						
Tilapia (US farmed)	YES	YES			YES	YES		APPROVED	
Weakfish								APPROVED	
Wreckfish			YES		YES			APPROVED	
White Seabass					YES			APPROVED	

Consensus Yellow									
Seafood Guides									
Item	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council
Black Sea Bass	YES							APPROVED	
Black Sea Bass (U.S. Mid-Atlantic)					YES			APPROVED	
Bluefish					YES			APPROVED	
Bluefish (Atlantic, U.S.)									
Catfish, Basa, Swai									
Basa/Tra/Vietnamese Catfish		YES							
Catfish, Basa, Swai (farmed)					YES				
Catfish, Basa, Swai (farmed, international)						YES			
Cod: Pacific	YES								
Cod: Pacific (trawled)		YES			YES				
Cod: Pacific (trawled, Canada, U.S.)						YES			
Crab									
Crab: Blue	YES	YES	YES		YES			APPROVED	
Crab: Snow	YES	YES	YES		YES				Kyoto Danish Seine Fishery Federation Snow Crab- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Crab: Snow (U.S. and Canada)						YES		APPROVED	
Crab: Tanner		YES	YES						
Crab: King									
Flounder: Pacific		YES			YES				Bering Sea and Aleutian Islands Flatfish Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Gulf of Alaska Flatfish Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Haddock (Hook and Line)		YES			YES			APPROVED	
Octopus									
Octopus (U.S.)						YES			
Octopus: Pacific									
Octopus: Pacific (Gulf of California)					YES				
Oysters (Wild)		YES			YES	YES			
Sablefish/Black Cod									
Sablefish/Black Cod (California, Oregon, Washington)		YES			YES	YES			
Salmon: Wild									
Salmon, Pacific wild (BC)						YES			British Columbia Pink and Chum Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; British Columbia Sockeye Salmon Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Iturup Island Pink & Chum Salmon Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Salmon: California, Oregon, Washington		YES			YES				
Sanddabs									
Sanddabs: Pacific					YES			APPROVED	
Shrimp (Wild U.S.)					YES				
Shrimp (Trawled, U.S. Gulf of Mexico and South Atlantic)						YES			
Shrimp: Northern					YES				

Consensus Yellow										
Seafood Guides										
Item	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council	
Shrimp: Northern (U.S. and Canada)			YES						Canadian Northern Prawn Trawl Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Gulf of St. Lawrence Northern Shrimp- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; West Greenland Coldwater Prawn Trawl Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION	
Sole										
Sole: Pacific	YES		YES			YES	YES	APPROVED	Bering Sea and Aleutian Islands Flatfish Fisheries- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Gulf of Alaska Flatfish Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Hastings Fleet Dover Sole Trammel Net Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED; Hastings Dover Sole Trawl and Gill Net Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED	
Tuna: canned	YES									
Tuna: canned light/canned white/albacore		YES				YES				
Tuna: canned light		YES	YES							
Tuna: canned white/albacore		YES	YES							

Consensus Red List Seafood Guides										
Item	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council	
Caviar										
Caviar (Wild)										
Caviar (Wild, Sturgeon)		YES								
Caviar (Wild, Beluga Sturgeon)	YES									
Caviar (Wild, Caspian Sea)	YES									
Caviar (Wild, imported)			YES			YES	YES			
Chilean Seabass/Toothfish	YES	YES	YES	YES		YES	YES			South Georgia Patagonian Toothfish Long Line Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED; Ross Sea Toothfish Longline Fishery- MSC IN ASSESSMENT
Chilean Seabass/Toothfish (non-certified)					YES					
Cod: Atlantic	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES			Domstein Long Liner Partners North East Arctic Cod and Haddock Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Cod: Atlantic (U.S. and Canada)										
Flounder										Kyoto Danish Seine Fishery Federation Flathead Flounder- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Flounder: Atlantic	YES	YES	YES			YES				
Flounder: Atlantic (U.S.)							YES			
Grouper	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES				
Haddock										Domstein Long Liner Partners North East Arctic Cod and Haddock Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Scottish White Fish Producers Association North Sea Haddock Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Haddock (Trawl)			YES			YES	YES			
Halibut: Atlantic		YES	YES	YES	YES	YES				
Halibut: Atlantic (US, trawl)							YES			
Halibut: Greenland				YES	YES					
Lobster: Spiny										
Lobster: Spiny (Caribbean, imported)						YES				
Lobster: Spiny (not U.S. & Australia)							YES			
Orange Roughy		YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES			
Salmon: Atlantic				YES						
Salmon: Atlantic (farmed)	YES	YES	YES			YES	YES			
Shrimp	YES									
Shrimp/prawns (imported)			YES		YES		YES			
Shrimp (imported - farmed and wild)		YES				YES				
Shrimp: Tropical (farmed and wild)				YES						
Skate	YES		YES	YES	YES					
Snapper	YES						YES			
Snapper: red			YES		YES	YES				
Snapper: red (Gulf of Mexico)				YES						
Snapper (Imported)			YES			YES				
Sole: Atlantic	YES	YES	YES			YES	YES			
Sturgeon, wild					YES					
Sturgeon Caviar (Wild caught)							YES			
Sturgeon Caviar (Imported, wild)						YES				
Tuna Bluefin			YES	YES	YES	YES	YES			
Tuna: Atlantic Bluefin		YES								

Clearly Non-Consensus

Seafood Guides

Item	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council
Pollock (Walleye)									Bering Sea and Aleutian Islands Pollock Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED; Gulf of Alaska Pollock Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED
Pollock (Alaska)			green	red	yellow		green		
Pollock (Alaska, Wild)							APPROVED		
Monkfish	red	yellow	red	red		red	red		
Monkfish (from depleted stocks)					red				
Shrimp	red								
Shrimp (farmed, U.S.)			green		yellow				
Trout: Rainbow (Farmed)		yellow	green		green				
Trout: Rainbow (land-based farmed)							green		
Trout: Rainbow (Canada, open-cage farmed)							yellow		

Too Tough to Call: Differentiation by Area, Gear Type or Other

Seafood Guides										
Item	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council	
Anchovies			green							
Anchovies (Bay of Biscay)					red					
Clams (Wild)			yellow		green	yellow				
Clams (dredged Atlantic)									red	
Clams: Pastanek (Wild)										APPROVED
Clams: Atlantic surf (Wild)						yellow				APPROVED
Clams: Countneck (Wild)										APPROVED
Clams: Hard (Wild)						yellow				APPROVED
Clams: Manila (Wild)										APPROVED
Clams: Softshell			green							APPROVED
Clams: Softshell/ Steamers (Wild)					green	yellow				APPROVED
Clams: Ocean Quahogs				red	yellow					
Clams: geoduck (US Pacific wild)						yellow				
Crab										
Crab: King	yellow	green								
Crab: King (imported)			red			red				
Crab: King (Russia)									red	
Crab: King (U.S.)			yellow			yellow	yellow			
Crab: King (Alaska)										APPROVED
Dogfish					red					
Dogfish (spiny - British Columbia)						yellow				British Columbia Spiny Dogfish Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Dogfish (U.S.)						red				
Haddock										Domstein Long Liner Partners North East Arctic Cod and Haddock Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION; Scottish White Fish Producers Association North Sea Haddock Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Haddock (U.S. - bottom longline)							yellow			
Haddock (Canada - bottom longline)							green			
Haddock (from Rockall Only)						red				
Hake										
Hake (European, from Southern Stocks)					red					
Hake (Cape - South Africa)					yellow					South African Hake Trawl Fishery- MSC CERTIFIED
Hake (Pacific, Canada)							green			Pacific Hake Mid-Water Trawl Fishery- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Hake: Silver, Red and Offshore						yellow				
Hake: White						red				
Halibut: Pacific		green	green			green			APPROVED	Pacific Halibut (Alaska, Washington, Oregon)- MSC CERTIFIED; Canadian Pacific Halibut (British Columbia)- IN ASSESSMENT FOR MSC CERTIFICATION
Halibut: Pacific (line caught)						yellow				
Halibut: Alaskan	green									
Halibut: Pacific (Canada, bottom long line)							yellow			
Herring: from depleted stocks						red				
Hoki				red						New Zealand Hoki- MSC CERTIFIED
Lingcod						yellow	yellow			
Lingcod (U.S. West Coast)		green								
Lobster										
Lobster: American	yellow									
Lobster: American, U.S. Atlantic							yellow			
Lobster: American, Maine		green	yellow			yellow		APPROVED		Maine Lobster-IN ASSESSMENT

Too Tough to Call: Differentiation by Area, Gear Type or Other

Seafood Guides									
Item	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council
Lobster: American, Canada		green					green		
Mahi Mahi (Dolphinfish)							yellow	APPROVED	
Mahi Mahi (Troll/Pole)	green	green							
Mahi Mahi (US)									
Mahi Mahi (imported)						yellow			
Mahi Mahi (US Atlantic Troll/Pole)						red			
Mahi Mahi (Imported troll/pole)								APPROVED	
Mahi Mahi (Long Line)	yellow								
Mahi Mahi (U.S. long line)									
Mahi Mahi (Imported long line)									
Mahi Mahi (handline)						yellow			
Rockfish									
Rockfish (trawl)									
Rockfish: Pacific									
Rockfish: Pacific (trawl)									
Rockfish (Alaska, British Columbia, hook and line)									
Rockfish: US West Coast									
Rockfish: Black (California, Oregon)									
Scallops									Patagonian Scallop- MSC CERTIFIED
Scallops: Sea	yellow	yellow							
Scallops: Sea (wild, New England and Canada)									
Scallops: Sea (Canada and Northeast)									
Scallops: Sea (wild, Northeast Atlantic U.S.)									
Scallops: Sea (wild, Canada)									
Scallops: Sea (Georges Bank and mid-Atlantic)									
Scallops: Sea (wild, Mid Atlantic)									
Scallops (dive-caught)									
Shark	red	red	red	red	red	red			
Shark (U.S., Pacific)									
Shark (deepwater)									
Shark (Atlantic, International)									
Squid	yellow	green							
Squid (except U.S. Longfin)									
Squid: Shortfin									
Squid (Pacific)									
Squid: Longfin									
Squid: Longfin (U.S)									APPROVED
Swordfish	yellow	yellow							
Swordfish (Pacific)									
Swordfish (Hawaiian Harpoon/Handline)									
Swordfish (Canada)									APPROVED
Swordfish (Canada, harpoon)									
Swordfish (U.S.)									
Swordfish (U.S., harpoon)									
Swordfish (U.S., longline)									
Swordfish (imported)									
Swordfish (Canada, SE Atlantic Mediteranean, longline)									
Swordfish (North and South Atlantic)									
Swordfish (except from U.S. managed fisheries)									
Tilapia (farmed)									

Too Tough to Call: Differentiation by Area, Gear Type or Other

Seafood Guides										
Item	Audubon Society	Blue Ocean Institute	Env. Defense	Greenpeace	Marine Conservation Society (U.K.)	Monterey Bay	Sea Choice-Canada	Seafood Choices Alliance	Marine Stewardship Council	
Tilapia (U.S.)					green					
Tilapia (Latin America)		yellow								
Tilapia (Asia)		red								
Tilapia (China, Taiwan)						red				
Tuna										
Tuna (troll-caught)						green				
Tuna (U.S., pelagic longline)						yellow				
Tuna (Pacific, pelagic longline)						red				
Tuna Albacore										
Tuna Albacore (N Atlantic, Med. and Indian Ocean)				red						
Tuna Albacore (US, BC troll/pole)					green					
Tuna Albacore (US, Canada)		green								
Tuna Albacore (longline)		yellow			red					
Tuna Albacore (pole/troll-caught)	green	green							American Albacore Fishing Association Pacific (North and South Pacific) - MSC CERTIFIED	
Tuna Albacore (S. Pacific/S. Atl. Troll/Pole, Handline)				yellow						
Tuna Albacore (Pacific Troll/Pole, Handline)							APPROVED			
Tuna Albacore (South Atlantic)			red							
Tuna Skipjack										
Tuna Skipjack (long line)		yellow								
Tuna Skipjack (Troll/pole)					green					
Tuna Skipjack (Troll/pole Pacific or Maldives)				yellow						
Tuna Yellowfin			red							
Tuna Yellowfin (US troll/pole*)		green								
Tuna Yellowfin (US Atlantic troll/pole)							APPROVED			
Tuna Yellowfin (pole/troll-caught)	green	green			yellow					
Tuna Yellowfin (pole/troll, Pac or Atl)				yellow						
Tuna Yellowfin (imported pole/troll-caught)		yellow								
Tuna Yellowfin (longline-caught)	yellow	yellow			red					
Tuna Yellowfin (imported longline-caught)			red							
Tuna Bigeye			red	red						
Tuna Bigeye (pole/troll-caught)	green	green			yellow					
Tuna Bigeye (imported pole/troll-caught)		yellow								
Tuna Bigeye (longline-caught)	yellow	yellow			red					
Tuna Bigeye (imported longline-caught)			red							
Tuna Ahi										
Tuna Ahi (longline)	yellow									
Tuna Ahi (poll/troll-caught)	green									